

PURDUE

UNIVERSITY

SCHOOL OF NUCLEAR ENGINEERING

400 Central Drive
W. LAFAYETTE, IN 47907-1290
(765) 496-9696, tsoukala@ecn.purdue.edu

Confidential

Office of the Inspector General
Office of Naval Research
875 N. Randolph Street, Suite 376
Arlington, VA 22203-1995
Email: ONR_IG@onr.navy.mil

January 29, 2007

Dear Madam/Sir:

I am writing to you because I am concerned that Purdue University is not fulfilling its contractual obligations while handling allegations of research misconduct on its ONR-funded projects. Furthermore, I accuse Purdue of failing to report to you, as required, the results of preliminary inquiries. I am also concerned that Purdue is falsely claiming that the research in question is not federally funded; and doing this as an excuse not to follow its obligations under their contract with the ONR.

The above accusations refer to Purdue's response to widespread concerns about the research of Rusi P. Taleyarkhan on a new form of energy which he calls "bubble fusion." The work appears to involve serious research integrity issues and is suspected of being fraudulent. Taleyarkhan claims over \$2.5M of research funds have gone from ONR to bubble fusion (also called "sonofusion") while at Oak Ridge National Laboratory and at Purdue University which he joined in 2003.

The evidence that Purdue is conducting an investigation which it failed to disclose to ONR includes, but is not limited to, the following:

1. In March 2006, following allegations of misconduct appearing in *Nature*, Purdue said it would have an inquiry (see Attachment I). An Examination Committee was established for that purpose with three highly respected members of Purdue's faculty, Dr. Byron Pipes (bpipes@purdue.edu), Dr. Ronald G. Reifenberger (reifenbr@purdue.edu, tel: 765 494-3032) and Dr. Dale Compton. I met with the committee for over two hours on May 17, 2006 with the understanding that they were performing the phase of initial inquiry into the bubble fusion misconduct allegations.

2. In June 2006 the Purdue Administration said that a preliminary determination was reached but that it would not publicly disclose it. The announcement drew skeptical commentary from the press (see Attachment II).
3. That determination was also NOT disclosed to the ONR. This is in violation of DOD's Instruction on Research Integrity and Misconduct (Number 3210.7).
4. The June 2006 determination was to proceed to a full fledged investigation, as colleagues were appointed to such a committee. One such colleague is Dr. Sangtae Kim (Distinguished Professor of Engineering).
5. Again Purdue did not inform the ONR of the formation of such a committee.
6. A month later Dr. Kim was removed from the committee.
7. A communication from Provost Sally Mason on July 7, 2006 addressed to me which indicates that Purdue is conducting an investigation on bubble fusion (see Attachment III).
8. A statement by Purdue's spokesman, Mr. Joe Bennett, who is reported as having said that he has "confirmed for the first time that there is an ongoing inquiry at the university" (in "Purdue Attacked over Fusion Inquiry," *Nature* pp 664-665, December 7, 2006, see Attachment IV).
9. An email thread where Dean Leah Jamieson alludes to appointing an investigation committee (see Attachment V). Quoting dean Jamieson:

"have [no] role or knowledge of the inquiry, beyond having appointed the [investigation] committee."

It should be noted that the three-member Examination Committee performing the phase of initial inquiry into bubble fusion was appointed by her predecessor in March of 2006. Thus the committee Dean Jamieson is likely referring to the Investigation Committee.

This thread also involves an interesting discussion between Provost Mason and Drs Jamieson, Taleyarkan, Rutledge, and Dunn suggesting a potential cover up. Several Purdue officials might have been involved including, but not limited to, Provost Sally K. Mason (sfmason@purdue.edu, 765-494-9709), the dean of engineering, Dr. Leah H. Jamieson (lhj@purdue.edu, 765-494-5346), the vice president for research, Dr. Charles (Chip) O. Rutledge (chipr@purdue.edu, 765 494-6209) and the associate vice president for research, Dr. Peter E. Dunn (pedunn@purdue.edu, 765-494-3996).

The thread also indicates a curious understanding shared between Rusi Taleyarkhan and Provost Mason and her associates (Jamieson, Rutledge, Dunn). To quote Provost Mason:

"Can someone calm Rusi? Chip [Rutledge]? Pete [Dunn]?"

List of Individuals with Potential Information Pertaining to the Allegation

Professor Kenneth S. Suslick, Dept. of Chemistry, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 600 S. Mathews Ave., Urbana, Illinois 61801, tel: (217) 333-2794, email: ksuslick@uiuc.edu

Professor Seth Putterman, Dept of Physics, UCLA, 2-234 Knudsen, Los Angeles, CA 90095, tel: (310) 825-2269, email: puherman@ritva.physics.ucla.edu

Ms Eugenie Samuel Reich, Freelance, *Nature*, tel: 617-354-0329, email: eugenie.reich@gmail.com

Professor Frank Clikeman, Purdue University, 400 Central Drive, West Lafayette, IN 47907-2017, tel: (765) 463-4333, email: clikeman@ecn.purdue.edu

Professor Chan K. Choi, Purdue University, 400 Central Drive, West Lafayette, IN 47907-2017, tel: (765) 494-6789, choi@ecn.purdue.edu

Professor Mamoru Ishii, Purdue University, 400 Central Drive, West Lafayette, IN 47907-2017, tel: (765) 494-4587

Professor Tatjana Jevremovic, Purdue University, 400 Central Drive, West Lafayette, IN 47907-2017, tel: (765) 494-4480, email: tatjanaj@ecn.purdue.edu

Professor Karl O. Ott, Purdue University, 400 Central Drive, West Lafayette, IN 47907-2017, tel: (765) 463-7291

Dr. Anton Bougaev, Purdue University, 400 Central Drive, West Lafayette, IN 47907-2017, tel: (765) 430-7030, email: bougaev@ecn.purdue.edu

Mr. Joshua Clinton Walter, Purdue University, 400 Central Drive, West Lafayette, IN 47907-2017, email: jcwalter@ecn.purdue.edu