

To: Joshua Clinton Walter <jcwalter@ecn.purdue.edu>
From: Ken Suslick <ksuslick@uiuc.edu>
Subject: CONFIDENTIAL: Research Discussion
Cc:
Bcc: Seth Putterman <PuHerman@ritva.physics.ucla.edu>, Steve Hopkins <shopkins@uiuc.edu>
Attached:

How very interesting, Josh. I'm unaware of the Nureth-11 report, either it's original version or the one actually presented. I'll ask Seth for a copy.

Josh, let me ask a very delicate question here. It sounds to me, reading between the lines, that you are suggesting that scientific fraud or at least academic misconduct has taken place by Xu and Butt, and possibly Taleyarkhan? I can readily believe that, but if so, it means that we must be very diligent in documenting your physical work and written notes, reports, etc., partly to make the case as strong as possible and even more importantly to protect you and Anton from any possible retaliation for such 'whistleblowing'.

I would be very happy to meet with you here. In fact I could arrange to have our university's Ethics Officer also attend as a confidential observer to provide advice.

Please let me know your thoughts on this.

Best regards,

Ken

At 04:58 PM 10/13/2005, you wrote:

Dear Dr. Suslick,

Thanks for getting me the video link.
Sounds like you are heading down the same path that we did (drawings, settings, and so forth). I believe that a copy of a report of ours was given to Dr. Putterman describing some of our work here.? That report was originally going to be submitted to NURETH-11 with a null result, however it was decided not to publish. Because the report was intended to be made public, there were many details missing.

Xu, Butt, and Revankar presented a paper at NURETH-11 last week, however it was mostly like the one in NED. Xu is Taleyarkhan's post-doc and Butt is one of his Master's students. Neither Xu nor Butt worked on the project prior to Taleyarkhan arriving at Purdue.

My colleague, Anton Bougaev, and I performed most of the physical work that was undertaken here prior to Rusi's arrival. We are both interested in talking further with you. If you are interested, it would not be a problem for us to drive to UIUC to discuss this.

Thanks,

Josh

On Wed, 12 Oct 2005, Ken Suslick wrote:

Hi, Josh.

I presume you're referring to the paper by Yiban Xua and Adam Butt (was there more than one paper!?). I've been very curious about that paper and how independent it truly was of Taleyarkhan, and you seem to know more about it than I've been able to get from Rusi. You've certainly got my curiosity picqued!

Currently, I have a student from my labs out working at UCLA with Seth Putterman and his group trying to reproduce Taleyarkhan's experiment quite precisely. DARPA gave a chunk of money to Seth, myself, and especially Rusi to independently verify Rusi's results. As part of this, Rusi had to reveal very precise details of his experiment (including the cell design engineering drawings). That work is ongoing, but so far, no neutrons have been detected.

I'd be delighted to chat with you more anytime.

--Ken

At 09:33 AM 10/12/2005, you wrote:

Dear Dr. Suslick,

Hello, my name is Joshua Walter. I am a PhD student at Purdue University. I have been following your work on sonoluminescence for some time. Myself and some other colleagues were given the task of trying to reproduce Dr. Taleyarkhan's experiment (with his cooperation), which we had started in the summer of 2002. I'll just say that none of the original people who worked on the experiment were in the NED/NURETH-11 papers (although they managed to throw a couple of us in the acknowledgements).

I did not get to see your BBC presentation and I am very curious about the research that you performed. While we were working on the project, we weren't really guided to understand the physics of what was happening. I am no longer working on the project, but I still find the physics interesting. I am hoping that I can contact you further to discuss some bubble dynamics and perhaps talk about each others experience in working on this project.

Much Appreciation,
Josh

Kenneth S. Suslick
Marvin T. Schmidt Professor of Chemistry
School of Chemical Sciences
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign
Chemical and Life Sciences Building, Room A422
600 S. Mathews Ave.
Urbana, IL 61801
USA

tel: 217-333-2794
fax: 217-333-2685
email: ksuslick@uiuc.edu
web: <http://www.scs.uiuc.edu/~suslick/>

Kenneth S. Suslick

Marvin T. Schmidt Professor of Chemistry

School of Chemical Sciences

University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

Chemical and Life Sciences Building, Room A422

600 S. Mathews Ave.

Urbana, IL 61801

USA

tel: 217-333-2794

fax: 217-333-2685

email: ksuslick@uiuc.edu

web: <http://www.scs.uiuc.edu/~suslick/>